

## 研究ノート

A Drawing for the Villa Madama's Stucco Relief:  
Notes on the Figural Drawing by Giovanni da Udine

Maria FUKADA

A pen and ink drawing in the Gabinetto dei Disegni e delle Stampe degli Uffizi (fig. 1)<sup>1</sup> in Florence depicts a nude woman with a winged Cupid and Pan in a bedroom. In the Uffizi, the drawing is attributed to Giulio Romano and is described on the inventory card as 'Giovane donna nuda seduta tenendo con la mano sinistra per i capelli un satiro seduto a terra, in atto in dietro un putto.' Although rarely discussed before, the composition of this drawing is identical to one of the stucco reliefs of Villa Madama: *The Punishment of Pan by Venus*, the south-western stucco relief of the inner arch of the atrium (figs. 2, 3). Villa Madama is located on Monte Mario in Rome. It was planned by Raphael and its inner rooms were decorated by his pupils Giulio Romano, Giovanni Francesco Penni, Giovanni da Udine and others. The decoration work began in 1520 and continued until the Sack of Rome occurred in 1527<sup>2</sup>. The decoration of the atrium is considered to have been completed in 1525, and this fact is attested by the inscription '1525' in the pilaster along with the name of Giovanni da Udine, the stucco work specialist in Raphael's workshop.

The current attribution of the Uffizi drawing possibly indicates that the classification may have been based in relation to the decoration of Villa Madama. Previous studies on the Villa Madama, however, have paid scant attention to the drawing discussed in the present paper and have not examined it in any detail. My purpose here is to reconsider its author attribution and its function.

**The Style and Function of the Uffizi Drawing**

Giulio Romano may have left this design for the atrium just before his departure to Mantua in the Autumn of 1524. However, the pale and faint tone of the drawing and the anatomical ambiguity of its figures are not congruent with Giulio Romano's style of drawing. Who, then, visualised this design and for what purpose? Let us consider the latter question first and observe some



fig. 1 Circle of Raphael, here attributed to Giovanni da Udine (?), *The Punishment of Pan by Venus*. 1524–25 ca. Pen and brown ink, wash color, highlighted with white lead. Florence, Gabinetto dei Disegni e delle Stampe degli Uffizi, inv. 13342F, 136 × 140 mm



fig. 2 *The Punishment of Pan by Venus*. Atrium's inner arch of Garden Loggia, Rome, Villa Madama



fig. 3 Atrium's inner arch of Garden Loggia, Rome, Villa Madama, 1525ca.

details of the composition.

The Uffizi sheet depicts three figures on the mounted round paper cut into a square form. In the composition, a naked Venus sits on Pan's knee and grabs a bunch of his hair (or a horn) with her left hand, twisting her head to the back. Pan, sitting on the ground, extends his right arm and tries to touch her waist. Behind them, Cupid stands on the bed making a threatening action toward Pan. Venus' right thigh is placed on a tall-shaped amphora. A curtain and a part of the bed are seen in the background on the left side of the drawing. In terms of the graphic technique, each figure is depicted in a light pen and ink contour. Parallel hatching and brown wash are applied to represent the shadows of the figures.

Obviously, the composition of the drawing is identical to that of the stucco relief found in the Villa Madama. However, differences may be observed in several details. In the drawing, the curve of the curtain over the bed is rounded and it nearly touches Venus' right elbow; in the stucco relief, the curtain is more upright in shape and is depicted at a distance from the figure. While the amphora stands almost vertically in the drawings, it leans slightly to the left in the relief, as if it follows Venus' motion. Further, Pan's face is depicted in profile in the relief but in the drawing, his face is shown in a three-quarter view. The angle of Venus's left hand is also rather different.

In particular, the differences in the direction of Pan's head and in the angle of the bed in the background seem to reveal the function of the drawing. It is unlikely that the draftsman would have changed them in the drawing if he had simply intended to copy the composition of the stucco relief. It is more natural to contemplate these differences as being conceived during the process of the execution of the relief. It may thus be concluded that the drawing is a preparatory illustration and not a copy that was made after the execution of the stucco relief. Therefore, the Uffizi drawing can be added to the extant group of preparatory drawings for the Villa's decoration<sup>3</sup>.

### Villa Madama's Preparatory Drawings and Their Draftsmen

Who, then, is the author of the Uffizi drawing? As already mentioned, the faint contours, the light tones of wash colour and the anatomical ambiguity of the figures in the drawing rule out Giulio Romano's hand as its illustrator. The pen and ink sketch of Cupid (fig. 4), his preparatory drawing for Villa Madama, clearly shows an entirely different manner: a strong and clear definition of form through sharp contour lines in pen and brown ink<sup>4</sup>.

It may be reasonable to presume, however, that the invention of the erotic composition was itself derived from a design by Giulio Romano. A similar subject is found in one of Giulio Bonasone's prints probably based on Giulio Romano's idea conceived in the Mantuan period (fig. 5)<sup>5</sup>. It depicts a semi-nude Venus, Cupid and a satyr. Like in Villa Madama's stucco composition, the Goddess punishes a lecherous satyr in this print, but in a much bolder and more obscene manner. Around 1524, when the Villa Madama's atrium was being executed, Giulio and Giovanni Francesco Penni had to finish several other works, such as the murals in the Sala di Costantino, that Raphael had left incomplete. Thus, it is difficult to surmise the extent to which he could



fig. 4 Giulio Romano, *Cupid riding on a marine horse*. Pen and brown ink, Paris, Musée du Louvre, inv. 10469, 238 × 334 mm

intervene in the design even though one cannot entirely exclude the possibility that the stucco composition of the atrium in some way reflects Giulio Romano's idea.

There is no other sheet drawn by the same hand among the other known preparatory drawings for the Villa Madama's decorations. Peruzzi's vigorous graphic manner, typically seen in the Chatsworth drawing of Infant Bacchus (fig. 6), does not accord with the style of the Uffizi drawing<sup>6</sup>. The drawing in Vienna's Albertina, Juno on a cart drawn by two peacocks (fig. 7), is somewhat similar in style because of its use of soft wash but does not look as if it is made by the same hand that drew the *Punishment of Pan by Venus* at the Uffizi. Although the Albertina drawing was traditionally attributed to Giovanni da Udine, it has recently been reattributed to Penni by Gnann<sup>7</sup>. Gnann once noted that the soft outlines and the painterly rendering of the figures for this sheet belong to the manner of Giovanni da Udine. Later, however, observing the inexact details in the depiction of the birds, he refused the traditional attribution to the expert of animals and birds. The use of white heightening in the Vienna drawing is more delicate and refined in comparison to the Uffizi drawing, and the figures are more solidly constructed. Therefore, Penni should also be excluded from the authorship of the Uffizi drawing.

The painterly characteristics of the Uffizi drawing's style seems to suggest an author of Northern Italian origin. In fact, its extensive use of wash and highlights and the absence of clear outlines resemble, for example, some of Sebastiano del Piombo's compositional studies like the *Assumption of the Virgin* in Amsterdam<sup>8</sup> rather than the work of Tuscan or Roman draftsmen. Although no other comparable drawing is known to have survived among Giovanni da Udine's secure drawings, such features may indicate the possibility that the sheet was indeed drawn by Giovanni himself as a preparatory study for the atrium stucco relief. Cardinal Giulio de' Medici's letters to Mario Maffei indicate that Giulio Romano was responsible for the designs of the narrative compositions



fig. 5  
Giulio Bonasone after  
Giulio Romano, *Venus  
with satyr and Cupid*.  
Engraving. Rome,  
Istituto nazionale per la  
grafica, fondo Corsini,  
71109, 207 × 127 mm



fig. 6 Baldassarre Peruzzi, *Infant Bacchus and satyrs*. Pen and  
brown ink, highlighted with white lead. Chatsworth,  
Trustees of the Chatsworth Settlement, Case 27, n. 41,  
178 × 242 mm



fig. 7 Giovanni Francesco Penni, *Juno on the cart drawn by two  
peacocks*. Pen and brown ink, highlighted with white lead.  
Vienna, Graphische Sammlung Albertina, SR 257, R 105,  
inv. 214, 214 × 279 mm



in the Villa's decoration<sup>9</sup>, but Giovanni may himself have invented compositions in the late phase of the work when the atrium stucco reliefs were executed.

Some stucco figures executed by Giovanni da Udine, like the medallion in Pope Clement VII's Stufetta in the Castel Sant'Angelo (fig. 8)<sup>10</sup> or the mythological scene in the Camerino di Callisto in the Palazzo Grimani at Santa Maria Formosa in Venice (fig. 9)<sup>11</sup>, may be comparable to the figures depicted in the Uffizi drawing. Further, the figure of Venus painted by Giovanni in the Camerino di Apollo in the Palazzo Grimani (fig. 10)<sup>12</sup> shows a type of female nude fairly like Venus in the Uffizi drawing.

### Conclusion

We do not, however, have comparable figural drawings by Giovanni da Udine<sup>13</sup> to confirm this attribution definitively. No other study of narrative composition for the Villa Madama decoration has been discussed in the recent literature on Giovanni's drawings, apart from the Vienna drawing of Juno. Giovanni's work generally focuses on the studies of insects, birds, animals or musical instruments<sup>14</sup>. Besides, the distinction of hands among the draftsmen of Raphael's late workshop is still an arduous research topic. I believe that at least this neglected drawing, connected with his securely datable stucco relief, is an interesting candidate for one significant addition to the graphic corpus of the artist even though it is not easy to provide positive evidence to secure the attribution of the Uffizi sheet to Giovanni da Udine.



fig. 8 Giovanni da Udine, *Medallion with Cupid*. stucco relief, Stufetta of Clement VII, Rome, Castel Sant'Angelo



fig. 9 Giovanni da Udine, *Bath of nymphs*. Stucco relief, Camerino di Callisto, Venice, Palazzo Grimani a Santa Maria Formosa



fig.10 Giovanni da Udine, *Venus*. Fresco, Camerino di Apollo, Venice, Palazzo Grimani a Santa Maria Formosa

\* This paper is a revised version of a part of the author's Japanese publication: *The Decoration of the Villa Madama's Garden Loggia: Princely Iconography for the Medici Popes*, Tokyo, 2017. I am grateful for the help extended to my research by the Gabinetto dei Disegni e delle Stampe degli Uffizi. I would also like to thank Prof. Michiaki Koshikawa and Prof. Dr. Arnold Nesselrath who offered me significant suggestions. I appreciate MARUZEN-YUSHODO Co., Ltd. (<https://kw.maruzen.co.jp/kousei-honyaku/>) for the English language editing.

## Notes

- 1 Inv. no. 13342F. Pen and brown ink, with brown wash, heightened with white, attached on mounted round paper and cut in square; 136 × 140 mm.
- 2 For Villa Madama, R. Lefevre, *Villa Madama*, Rome, 1973; C. L. Frommel, "Die architektonische Planung der Villa Madama," *Römisches Jahrbuch für Kunstgeschichte*, XV, 1975, pp. 59–87; J. Shearman, "A Functional Interpretation of Villa Madama," *Römisches Jahrbuch für Kunstgeschichte*, XX, 1983, pp. 315–327; C. Cieri Via, "Villa Madama: una residenza "solare" per i Medici a Roma," in S. Colonna, ed. by, *Roma nella svolta tra Quattro e Cinquecento: atti del Convegno Internazionale di Studi*, Rome, 2004, pp. 349–373; C. Napoleone, *Villa Madama: Il sogno di Raffaello*, Turin, 2007.  
The iconographical study of the Garden Loggia by present author: M. Fukada, *The Decoration of the Villa Madama's Garden Loggia: Princely Iconography for the Medici Popes*, Tokyo, 2017 (Japanese text with English summary).
- 3 Ten preliminary drawings have been published so far. For central bay's vault painting: *Juno on the cart drawn by two peacocks*, Vienna, Graphische Sammlung Albertina, SR 257, R. 105, inv. 214.  
For South West bay's vault: *Seven Cupids playing with Swans*, Paris, Musée du Louvre, inv. 614; *Eight Cupids playing with a ball*, Paris, Musée du Louvre, inv. 615; *Daedalus making a cow for Pasiphae*, Florence, Gabinetto dei Disegni e delle Stampe degli Uffizi, inv. 569 E; *The Feast of Venus*, Private collection.  
For North East bay's vault: *Cupid riding on a marine horse*, Paris, Musée du Louvre, inv. 10469; *Salmacis and Hermaphroditos*, Paris, Musée du Louvre, inv. 10476; *Infant Bacchus and satyrs*, Chatsworth, Devonshire Collection, Case 27, n. 41; *Odysseus and the daughters of Lycomedes*, Los Angeles, Paul Getty Museum, inv. 85.GG.39.  
These drawings were first published by C.L. Frommel in *Baldassare Peruzzi als Maler und Zeichner, Beiheft zum Römisches Jahrbuch für Kunstgeschichte*, 11, 1967/68, cat. 58a–c, pp. 101–104, 109. Another drawing, *Statue of a nude man in the niche*, attributed to Marcantonio Raimondi (Paris, Musée du Louvre, inv. 20730), probably related to the stucco relief decoration of the central vault of the Garden Loggia. D. Cordelliere and B. Py, *Raffaello e i suoi*, Rome, 1992, cat. 147, p. 341.  
Cordelliere and Py indicate that *Standing Apollo* (Paris, Musée du Louvre, inv. 10386), one of the drawings that was listed by Frommel, bears a close relation to an engraving print by Maestro del Dado. D. Cordellier and B. Py, *Raphaël: son atelier, ses copistes. Inventaire général des dessins italiens, Musée du Louvre*, V, Paris, 1992, cat. 983.
- 4 Cordellier and Py, *Raffaello e i suoi*, cit., cat. 146, p. 340.
- 5 Massari was the first to attribute the print to Giulio Bonasone after Giulio Romano, and Talvacchia supported her opinion. L. Dunand, *Les Compositions de Jules Romain intitulées Les amours des dieux, gravées par Marc-Antoine Raimondi: suite d'estampes présentée dans un ensemble d'oeuvres d'art restituant le climat d'humanisme de la Renaissance*, Lausanne, 1977, p. 172; S. Massari, *Giulio Bonasone*, Rome, 1983, p. 62; B. Talvacchia, in E. H. Gombrich et al., *Giulio Romano*, exh. cat., Mantua, 1989, p. 286.
- 6 M. Jaffé, *The Devonshire Collection of Italian Drawings: Tuscan and Umbrian schools*, London, 1994, cat. 89, p.120; Oberhuber and Gnann, *Roma e lo stile classico di Raffaello*, exh. cat., Mantua and Vienna, 1999, cat. 197, p. 279.
- 7 Oberhuber and Gnann, *Roma e lo stile classico di Raffaello*, cit., cat. 196, p. 278 (as Giovanni da Udine); A. Gnann and M.C. Plomp, *Raphael and His School*, exh. cat., Haarlem, 2012, cat. 66, p. 180 (as Giovanni Francesco Penni(?)).
- 8 Amsterdam, Rijksmuseum, inv. RP-T-1948-137: C. Strinati, ed. by, *Sebastiano del Piombo 1485–47*, exh. cat., Rome and Berlin, 2008, pp. 284–285.
- 9 Giulio de' Medici showed his intention in the two letters to Mario Maffei of June in 1520. According to the letter of 4th June, he expected Giovanni da Udine to make the stucco and Giulio Romano to depict the narrative scenes, or at least for Giulio to prepare drawings and then for Giovanni to depict the paintings after him. J. Shearman, *Raphael in Early Modern Sources*, New Haven and London, 2003, 1520/44, 46, pp. 599–601, 602–605.
- 10 B. Contardi and H. Lilius, ed. by, *Quando gli dei si spogliano: il bagno di Clemente VII a Castel Sant'Angelo e le altre stufe romane del primo Cinquecento*, Rome, 1984. According to Furlan, the decoration is datable to around 1527–1528. C. Furlan, "Dopo Raffaello," in N. Dacos and C. Furlan, *Giovanni da Udine: 1487–1561*, Udine, 1987, pp. 133–223.
- 11 A. Bristol, ed. by, *Palazzo Grimani a Santa Maria Formosa: Storia, arte, restauri*, Verona, 2008, pp. 62–72. The ceiling decoration of the Camerino di Callisto began in 1537 and was completed in 1539.
- 12 The ceiling of the Camerino di Apollo was decorated by Giovanni da Udine and Francesco Salviati in 1540. *Ibid.*, pp. 79–87.
- 13 Giovanni da Udine's drawing catalogue edited by Dacos: N. Dacos: "Traccia per un catalogo dei disegni", in Dacos and Furlan, *Giovanni da Udine: 1487–1561*, cit., pp. 237–255. Dacos attributed one of the preparatory drawing of the

oval painting of South West bay, *The Feast of Venus* to Giovanni da Udine. Oberhuber reattributed it to Raphael and Gnann advocates his opinion. Dacos, "Traccia per un catalogo dei disegni," cit., cat. 13, p. 247; K. Oberhuber, "Le donne secondo Raffaello," in *Raffaello: Grazia e bellezza*, exh. cat., Paris, 2001–2002, pp. 39–55, especially p. 44; A. Gnann, in A. Gnann, ed. by, *Raphael*, exh. cat., Vienna, 2017, pp. 407–409. The manner of the pen and ink drawing which represents Bacchus and two bacchantes in Edinburgh, proposed by A. Nesselrath as Giovanni da Udine's draft, is not comparable with the Uffizi drawing. A. Nesselrath, "Giovanni da Udine disegnatore," in *Bollettino. Monumenti musei e gallerie pontificie*, IX, 2, 1989, pp. 237–291, especially pp. 262–266, fig. 20.

- 14 A. Nesselrath in B. Kempers et al., *Hochrenaissance im Vatikan 1503–1534: Kunst und Kultur im Rom der Päpste*, Ostfildern, 1999, cat. 188, 310; C. Ruggeri, "Giovanni da Udine riparografo: alcune proposte per una "pittura di cose", in *Bollettino. Monumenti musei e gallerie pontificie*, XXXIV (2016), 2017, pp. 231–265.

## Illustration sources

Photo by author (figs. 1, 3) / Refevre, *Villa Madama*, cit. (fig. 2) / Cordellier and Py, *Raffaello e i suoi*, cit. (figs. 4, 6) / Gombrich et al., *Giulio Romano*, cit. (fig. 5) / Oberhuber and Gnann, *Roma e lo stile classico di Raffaello*, cit. (fig. 7) / Dacos and Furlan, *Giovanni da Udine*, cit. (figs. 8, 9) / Bristot, ed., *Palazzo Grimani a Santa Maria Formosa*, cit. (fig. 10)